



USAID
FROM THE AMERICAN PEOPLE

MENTORING OF MEDICAL SECTOR AMMAN – JORDAN

June 2008 Report

June 21, 2008

This publication was produced for review by the United States Agency for International Development. It was prepared by Dr. Assaf Al-Assaf / Emerging Markets Group (EMG)

MENTORING OF MEDICAL SECTOR AMMAN – JORDAN

June 2008 Report

USAID ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT PROGRAM

CONTRACT NUMBER: 278-C-00-06-00332-00

BEARINGPOINT, INC.

USAID/JORDAN

OFFICE OF ECONOMIC GROWTH

JUNE 21, 2008

AUTHOR: BY DR. ASSAF AL-ASSAF / EMERGING MARKETS
GROUP (EMG)

DELIVERABLE N^o: 4.1.6.1.14

DISCLAIMER:

The author's views expressed in this publication do not necessarily reflect the views of the United States Agency for International Development or the United States Government.

CONTENTS

FOREWORD..... 2

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY..... 3

SIGNIFICANT MEETINGS/ACTIVITIES..... 4

RECOMMENDATIONS AND SUGGESTED FOLLOW UP ACTIVITIES 7

CONCLUSIONS 8

FOREWORD

This report details the activities and conclusions of the first mentorship assignment of the medical sector. Following preliminary consultations between the Enhanced Productivity Component Lead, the Medical Sector Lead and the Mentor, the bulk of the mentor's work was carried out in Amman, Jordan from May 25, 2008 through June 20, 2008, under the guidance of the Jordanian office of the Sustainable Achievement of Business Expansion and Quality (SABEQ) project. This project represents one portion of a larger USAID project designed to improve all of the economic sectors in Jordan. The goal of the medical sector mentorship was to explore the possibilities of increased medical tourism in Jordan among other capacity building measures of the private medical sector towards international excellence. The capacity of Jordanian Private Hospitals Association and its member hospitals to meet international accreditation standards was seen as an important component of attracting international patients and achieving international quality reputation.

The Mentor from the United States working under the aegis of the Emerging Markets Group (EMG), provided daily and on-going advice to the medical sector lead in Jordan towards meeting the overall goal of the sector.

The objective of this assignment is to provide periodic mentorship by experienced Medical Services Sector veteran to the Component Four Medical Services Sector Lead. The mentor will impart additional sector-specific knowledge, expertise and insight, increasing the awareness of the Medical Services sector lead and/or verifying the perceptions and understanding of the sector lead with regard to the challenges, opportunities and needs/requirements of the Medical services sector.

The First part of this document is a report on the preliminary activities of the Mentor, followed by the recommendations and conclusions of the assignment. The second part of the document proposes a training plan to address the gaps found in the December/January assignment on hospital surveys.

This consultant would like to extend his thanks to the many persons at SABEQ and EMG as well as the many individuals at the Jordanian hospitals this Mentor has met for their much appreciated help and cooperation.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

This assignment was the first in a suggested series of two - three 3-week visits to SABEQ and work with the medical sector to provide mentorship and advice as needed related to this sector. This consultant provided consulting services to the SABEQ project in December 2007 conducting a hospital assessment, which provided the basis for this mentorship assignment in terms of background knowledge and proposed future activities.

The mentor accomplished the following tasks as proposed by the Project:

- Review the Medical Services Sector PEAP and value chain that have been developed
- Meet and interact with the Medical Services Sector lead and sector counterparts
- Meet and interact with the Component Four Lead as well as the Technical Oversight Specialist and the Medical Services Sector Lead during periodic missions as well as on a periodic basis via teleconferencing.
- Identify areas of redundancy, weakness, oversight and missed opportunities among the Medical Services Sector PEAP and value chain analysis.
- Interact with the Medical Services Sector associations and councils (if necessary) in coordination with and in the presence of the sector lead.
- Develop, document and occasionally deliver outlines, presentations and lectures on specific technical issues (Quality, Marketing, Safety...) utilizing the expert previous knowledge and experience as deemed necessary by Component Four Lead, the Technical Oversight Specialist or the Medical services Sector Lead.
- Provide suggestions on how to improve/modify/prioritize the PEAP with the objective of improving productivity, exports, and quality.
- Provide suggestions on how to improve/modify the Medical Services Sector value chain with the objective of improving productivity, exports, and quality (identify assumptions that are not clear, make suggestions, etc.)
- Provide desktop analysis and feedback on TORs, technical deliverables and sectoral strategies as deemed necessary by Component Four Lead, the Technical Oversight Specialist or the Medical Services Sector Lead.

This consultant also completed the following activities:

- Reviewed of PEAP and related documents and discuss with Medical Sector Lead.
- Recommended revisions and new activities for the Medical Sector to add to the PEAP.
- Participated in all of the preparatory sessions and assisted in the formulation of the business plan of PHA and to support PHA efforts towards continuous improvement.
- Provided advice to and participate in discussions with the Medical Sector Lead regarding the marketing strategies assignment for Medical Tourism.
- Visited one of the Private Hospitals (Al-Hyatt and Specialty) to assess capacity.
- Visited Jordan University Hospital towards training collaboration with SABEQ
- Visited JUST Hospital towards quality improvement and potential links with SABEQ
- Presented a 2 day workshop on JCI accreditation standards to PHA
- Participated in the discussions, analysis and critique of the Private Hospital Survey.
- Participated in a meeting regarding Higher education accreditation activities in Jordan.
- Met with Nursing Syndicate towards improvement and potential collaboration in training and credentialing of nurses in Jordan.
- Attended and participated in discussions regarding medical malpractice law (workshop by High Health Council).
- Provided advice on a possible study tour of the PHA reps to the USA.

SIGNIFICANT MEETINGS/ACTIVITIES

Besides the briefing and debriefing meetings, the mentor first met with the component and sector leadership as well as the leadership of the major hospital professional association in Jordan. Additionally, the Mentor also met with several other stakeholders among which are the following significant meetings:

Documents Review and Internal Meetings:

Al-Hayat Hospital - Amman

Contact: The Hospital Director

Significant Issues/Risks

- This is a fairly small hospital with referrals from East Amman and several patients from Arab countries.
- The hospital is interested in expanding its services to include more “foreign” patients from the Arab countries.
- The hospital director is also interested in applying high quality standards in its units towards at least the national and perhaps the international accreditation awards.

Lessons Learned

- The hospital has exhibited adequate resources to meet its client demands including relevant technologies and amenities.
- The Director is desirous of upgrading hospital facilities and amenities to meet customer demands.
- He is extremely interested in increasing his market and clientele to other markets or more individuals from the same current market.

Follow-up Activities and Plans for SABEQ Team and Government Counterparts

- SABEQ should follow up with the PHA President to include this hospital in its marketing plan to current and potential clients.
- SABEQ could include leadership of Hayat Hospital in future training and education of healthcare professionals.

JCI ACCREDITATION STANDARDS WORKSHOP (June 10-11, 2008)

Contacts: SABEQ Medical Sector

Significant Issues / Risks

- Although targeted to all Private and semi Private Hospital, only a partial list of such hospitals sent their representatives
- Several hospital representatives showed major interests in accreditation in general and in JCI standards in particular.
- A number of hospitals exhibited interest in SABEQ's assistance towards the preparation and implementation of the Accreditation standards in terms of training and technical assistance support.
- Almost all participants asked for follow up training workshops and detailed seminars on the accreditation standards and related issues.

Lessons Learned

- Several private Jordanian hospitals are interested in accreditation but have limited resources to pursue the implementation of accreditation standards.
- Access to experts/expertise in this field is not available and if available is extremely unaffordable to several of the smaller private hospitals.
- The participants indicated their interest in a follow up workshop/training towards detailed discussion and interpretations of the accreditation standards.
- Each of the participating hospitals exhibited interests in organizing a collaborative process towards further awareness and education on accreditation and its processes.

Follow-up Activities and Plans for SABEQ Team and Government Counterparts

- The Private Hospital Association (PHA) in collaboration with SABEQ should sponsor the organization of similar training workshops/seminar to its member hospitals especially for those that have not acquired accreditation.
- SABEQ could help identify such needs and assist PHA in meeting these needs for Private Hospitals in Jordan.
- SABEQ could establish contacts with MOH and High Health Council for collaboration and future cooperation.
- SABEQ/PHA could contact those hospitals that did not participate and identify reasons for not participating and perhaps ways to share the information from this workshop with them.

SPECIALTY HOSPITAL VIS A VIS PRIVATE HOSPITAL ASSOCIATION

Contact: Dr. Fawzi Al-Hammouri, Director General

Significant Issues / Risks

- There is a need to reorganize the PHA infrastructure; its membership, its Board and its administration.
- Membership to PHA should be expanded to include other types of hospitals and other healthcare entities related to hospital operations such as vendors, pharmaceuticals, labs and surgicenters.
- Developing an effective and comprehensive strategic and business plan for PHA will be a positive development towards strengthening its performance.
- Private Hospital leadership are in dire need for training and education in modern methods of leadership, management skills and performance improvement. Formal certification and credentialing of such individuals may prove beneficial.

Lessons Learned

- Benchmarking with similar associations and councils is critical towards expansion and performance improvement.
- Exposure to medical tourism sites and exploring methods of attracting the “non-traditional” patient market is encouraged.
- Certain hospitals such as Specialty may learn much needed skills and techniques of marketing, financial management and fundraising from US organizations and a study tour may prove beneficial as a short-term solution but twinning with interested hospitals is a better solution for the long term.
- There is limited or no significant continuing education activities being sponsored or co-sponsored by the PHA.

Follow-up Activities and Plans for SABEQ Team and Government Counterparts

- SABEQ should continue to communicate and collaborate with the PHA as the leading organization representing hospitals in Jordan.
- SABEQ is in the process of co-funding with PHA and members hospital a group of administrators travel and participation in a Medical Tourism conference in San Francisco in September. It behooves these administrators to gain experiences and establish effective networks with US organizations and entities to improve their Medical Tourism involvement and activities.
- SABEQ is also contemplating the support of arranging a study tour for a select group of hospital administrators to visit similar provider organizations and state hospital associations towards benchmarking and networking.
- SABEQ in cooperation with PHA should continue the monitoring of the effective implementation of the PHA business plan.

Listings of Other Activities and Meetings

Activity: Reviewed in depth the PEAP and value chain documents for the medical sector and the related documents and discussed with the Medical Sector Lead suggested revisions and additions to the document as outlined below.

Activity: Provided advice to and participate in discussions with the Medical Sector Lead regarding the strategic marketing assignment for Medical Tourism for Jordan.

Activity: Participated in the discussions and critique of outcomes of the Private Hospital survey. The survey intended to identify private hospital profiles and their feedback related to PHA's services and utility. It was recommended that the survey be redone and completed by more members with the help of PHA. The survey report will be formatted differently to achieve its objectives in communicating members concerns and feedback to the PHA Board and other hospital members.

Meeting: Several meetings and activities towards the development of a PHA Business plan Participated with the related USAID Consultant in several brainstorming and document development sessions.

Outcome: A viable PHA Business Plan is developed.

Meeting: Jordan University Hospital (contact: Dr. Abdel Karim Al-Qdha and Mohammad Shakakhwa) to identify collaboration activities towards training and development of health professionals throughout Jordan.

Outcome: Identified a "training Center" entity at the University Hospital towards the organizing and delivering of such training activities specific to health care professionals and care givers. SABEQ is to follow up with the related personnel to coordinate future activities and training agenda of the Center.

Meeting: King Abdullah Hospital – JUST (Drs. M. AlSheyyab and Ziad Al-Nasir) to identify needs and collaboration opportunities in such areas as Accreditation, Quality and performance improvement.

Outcome: The leadership staff at the hospital are very eager to collaborate with SABEQ on training issues and technical assistance.

Meeting: WB Consultant on Higher Education Accreditation shared her activities at the Ministry of Higher Education towards the development of Education Accreditation guidelines for the surveying and credentialing of Jordan's numerous education institutions.

Outcome: The attendees of the meeting developed a basic knowledge of the process towards national accreditation standards in particular the impact this process and standards would have on nursing and health professions schools.

Meeting: Participated in the High Health Council Workshop on the proposed Medical Malpractice Law in collaboration with the MOH under the patronage of the Prime Minister. All of the key players of the medical sector in Jordan were invited both in the private and the public sectors.

Outcome: Identified medical sector biases and needs and participated in the discussion of the contents and the formatting of the proposed law in Jordan.

Meeting: Jordan Nursing Syndicate towards collaboration and training opportunities

Outcome: Will be organizing a few workshops and courses towards the credentialing of Jordanian nurses in such areas as Risk Management, Healthcare Quality and Data Management.

RECOMMENDATIONS AND SUGGESTED FOLLOW UP ACTIVITIES

- Recommend revisions and new activities for the Medical Sector of SABEQ as follows:
 1. Add Dental Health and Cosmetic Dermatology and Surgery Services as subsets of the medical tourism specialties for marketing Jordan as a potential country for such services at quality but discounted rates.
 2. Expand the work of SABEQ's medical sector work to include the High Health Council as one of the main partners. Recently this Council is given heightened responsibilities (by MOH and Prime Minister's office) especially as it relates to Medical Malpractice and Liability Insurance.
 3. Although the concentration has been on private hospitals and PHA as a start but lets not forget the other sectors and providers, such as the Universities, Ambulatory care Facilities, Laboratories, Imaging Centers, Insurance Companies. These entities play an important role in shaping the medical sector and they could be involved (based on available time and resources) in future SABEQ's activities and priority areas.
 4. In the process of continuous improvement of hospital infrastructure, SABEQ could organize additional workshops/courses towards this goal. Suggested topics may include:
 - i. developing plans, policies and procedures,
 - ii. improvement of documentation of care processes,
 - iii. patient safety,
 - iv. risk management and facility safety,
 - v. performance measurements and improvement techniques,
 - vi. leadership skills,
 - vii. credentialing of hospital administrators,
 - viii. human resources issues,
 - ix. management and use of health information,
 - x. marketing, fundraising and public relations skills
 - xi. pain management, as well as
 - xii. care givers competencies (ACLS, ATLS, Nursing Care, CME, etc.)

5. Continue the education activities on accreditation and organize another but more in-depth workshop/course on JCI accreditation to area hospitals.
6. Since Medical Malpractice and liability issues are becoming such hot issues in Jordan (and the region), it behooves SABEQ to identify a qualified consultant/trainer to deliver a national workshop entitled “how to prevent and deal with malpractice”. This could be addressed to caregivers of all types.
7. Continue to work with PHA to strengthen its infrastructure and roles (e.g. monitor and encourage the implementation of the business plan).
8. Continue to work with the Jordanian Medical Council and Syndicate (e.g. certification programs, CME activities, accreditation, etc.).
9. Continue to work with the Jordanian Nursing Council (certification programs, CEU's, nursing education, etc.).
10. Establish ties and commence working with the much larger and more influential Jordan Nursing Syndicate (nursing issues, lobbying, CEU's and education).
11. Explore the idea of centralizing the medical tourism organization, marketing and arrangements (e.g. medical travel agency, centralized fee schedules, website, centers of excellence, centralized marketing and performance database, etc.). Another possibility is to re-establish the National Medical Tourism Council.
12. Explore the idea of utilizing IT and new technologies to offer Imaging Center services to international care provider organizations (for the purpose of efficiency and cost reduction).

CONCLUSIONS

As a first mentorship visit, this assignment was perfect to discuss working relationship for a long term interactive process with the Sector Lead. Unfortunately, the current Lead left on a leave of absence for the next 6 month and that may cause some decrease in the activity of this project sector. Yet it is anticipated that the acting Sector Lead will fill the gap and will be as enthusiastic to fulfill the needs identified and follow up activities related to this sector. Several of the follow up activities are important to pursue and would require a consorted effort of the different players to accomplish. It behooves the Sector Lead to continue to identify sector priorities and to actively pursue those that are both doable and beneficial to SABEQ's clients.

Future mentorship assignments should tackle some of these priorities and assist the Sector Lead to systematically complete most of these activities. Partnerships with key players in the Sector will be crucial to the success of these activities and goals.

USAID Jordan Economic Development Program
Salem Center, Sequleyah Street
Al Rabieh, Amman
Phone: +962 6 550 3050
Fax: +962 6 550 3069
Web address: <http://www.sabeq-jordan.org>